Ethical Reflections on Harm-Benefit Analyses

Gillian K. D. Crozier
Philosopher and CRC on Environment, Culture and Values
Laurentian University, Sudbury ON
CCAC National Workshop 2014
DIRECTIVES

DIRECTIVE 2010/63/EU OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL
of 22 September 2010
on the protection of animals used for scientific purposes
(Text with EEA relevance)

THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND THE COUNCIL OF THE
EUROPEAN UNION,

Having regard to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European
Union, and in particular Article 114 thereof,

Having regard to the proposal from the European Commission,

Having regard to the opinion of the European Economic and
Social Committee (1),

After consulting the Committee of the Regions,

Acting in accordance with the ordinary legislative procedure (2),

Whereas:

(1) On 24 November 1986 the Council adopted Directive
86/609/EEC (3) in order to eliminate disparities between
laws, regulations and administrative provisions of the
Member States regarding the protection of animals used
for experimental and other scientific purposes. Since the
adoption of that Directive, further disparities between
Member States have emerged. Certain Member States
have adopted national implementing measures that
ensure a high level of protection of animals used for
and other scientific purposes (4). By becoming party to
that Convention, the Community acknowledged the
importance of the protection and welfare of animals
used for scientific purposes at international level.

(4) The European Parliament in its resolution of 5 December
2002 on Directive 86/609/EEC called for the
Commission to come forward with a proposal for a
revision of that Directive with more stringent and trans-
parent measures in the area of animal experimentation.

(5) On 15 June 2006, the Fourth Multilateral Consultation of
Parties to the European Convention for the protection of
vertebrate animals used for experimental and other
scientific purposes adopted a revised Appendix A to
that Convention, which set out guidelines for the
accommodation and care of experimental animals. Commission
Recommendation 2007/516/EC of 18 June 2007 on
guidelines for the accommodation and care of animals
used for experimental and other scientific purposes (5)
incorporated those guidelines.
I.
Bateson’s Cube

Importance of Research

Likelihood of Benefit

Animal Suffering

Least Acceptable

Most Acceptable
Bateson Cube – Modification A

- Importance of Research
  - High
  - Low

- Likelihood of Benefit
  - High
  - Low

- Degree of Valid Dissent
  - High
  - Low

- Most Acceptable

- Least Acceptable
Bateson Cube – Modification B

Threshold of Valid Dissent for Species X

Importance of Research

Least Acceptable

Most Acceptable

Animal Suffering

Likelihood of Benefit

High

Low

High

Low

High

Low

0

1

0

High

Low

High

Low

Least Acceptable

Most Acceptable

Importance of Research

Likelihood of Benefit

Animal Suffering
Bateson Cube – Modification B

Threshold of Valid Dissent for Species Y

Importance of Research

Least Acceptable

Likelihood of Benefit

Animal Suffering

High

Low

High

Low

Most Acceptable

0

1

0
Thank you

g.crozier@gmail.com
ceeec.wordpress.com
@CEECEC_LU
sites.google.com/site/gilliancrozier